

**Minutes**  
**Baltimore County Landmarks Preservation Commission**  
**February 26, 2014 Meeting**

Mr. Rob Brennan, Chairperson, opened the regular monthly meeting of the Baltimore County Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) at 6: 00 p.m. The following Commission members were:

<u>Present</u>	<u>Not Present</u>
Mr. Robert P. Brennan, Chairperson	Mr. David J. Bryan
Ms. Nancy W. Horst, Vice-Chair	Ms. Barbara Eckley
Ms. Carol Allen	Ms. Faith Nevins Hawks
Ms. Rose A. Benton	Mr. Ed Hord
Mr. C. Bruce Boswell	Mr. Qutub U. K. Syed
Mr. Louis Diggs	
Mr. Stephen P. Myer	
Mr. Christopher Norman	
Mr. David S. Thaler	

Attending County staff, Jeff Mayhew (Deputy Director, Department of Planning), Karin Brown (Chief, Preservation Services), Teri Rising (Preservation Services staff), Jennifer Frankovich (Assistant County Attorney, Law Office) and Vicki Nevy (Secretary to the Commission).

1. Review of the Agenda

Ms. Brown noted two items were added to the Preliminary Agenda published February 6, 2014.

3. Approval of the Minutes

Mr. Brennan asked if anyone proposed changes to the January 9, 2014 Minutes. Hearing none, he called for a motion to approve the Minutes as drafted. Mr. Diggs moved to approve the Minutes. Mr. Boswell seconded the motion, which passed unanimously on a voice vote.

**Public Hearing on Nomination to the Preliminary Landmarks List**

4. “Land Mark Lodge No. 40 Free and Accepted Masons” structure and setting, 48 ½ Winters Lane, (MIHP # BA2646), contributing structure in the Winters Lane National Register Historic District [County Council District #1]

Ms. Rising presented the history of the property and read staff’s recommendation to support the nomination.

Mr. Brennan determined no one present wished to speak either in support or against the nomination.

Mr. Diggs reported that Mr. William Foreman, a member of the organization owning the property and the person who submitted the nomination, had been in touch with him and advised him that he would not be able to attend the evening’s meeting. Mr. Diggs explained the structure is one of just a few African American lodge buildings remaining in Baltimore County.

Mr. Thaler asked Mr. Diggs if the organization supports the nomination. Mr. Diggs replied they do.

Mr. Boswell asked if there are other properties in Winters Lane on the Final Landmarks List. Mr. Diggs said there are perhaps 3 or 4.

Mr. Brennan asked if the old school house located at the intersection of Winters Lane and Edmondson Avenue was on the Final Landmarks List. Mr. Diggs responded that regrettably it was not. He explained the school house is owned by a church not familiar with the heritage of the community and has not been open to consider a nomination to date.

Mr. Brennan commended Ms. Rising on the excellent report prepared by her for the nomination. Mr. Diggs agreed the report was very thorough and informative.

Mr. Diggs moved to vote to (a) place the “ Landmark Lodge No. 40 Free and Accepted Masons” structure on the Preliminary Landmarks List under criteria (1) –for its association with the National Register Historic District of Winters Lane; for its association with the history of the African American Masonic Fraternal Organization in Baltimore County (2) - as a representative example of fraternal lodge architecture with its historic integrity intact through its retention of the original form without any significant alterations; as an example from the 19th century period of construction within the community (b) to delineate the property .28 acres (map 101, parcel 92) as its historic environmental setting. Mr. Thaler seconded the motion which passed unanimously on a voice vote.

#### **Alteration to properties in County Historic Districts or Landmark structures**

5. “The Alms House”, 9831 Van Buren Lane, Cockeyville vicinity, Final Landmarks List # 232, (MIHP # BA73); installation of a central air conditioning system [County Council District #3]

Ms. Brown explained staff received a complaint that incompatible exterior work had commenced at the front façade of the Alms House without prior approval from the LPC. A Technical Committee consisting of Messrs. Brennan, Myer, Hord and Diggs and Ms. Benton and Ms. Allen met with representatives from the County Property Management Office to develop a proposal that would minimizing the visual impact associated with the installation of an air conditioning system.

The Technical Committee’s worked out a resolution that was acceptable to Committee members and County Property Management staff. Mr. Myer prepared a Technical Committee report describing the project and the issues involved.

Mr. Thaler moved to vote to issue a Notice to Proceed, as per the Technical Committee’s recommendation. Mr. Boswell seconded the motion which passed unanimously on a voice vote.

6. Pine Grove School, 9423 Old Harford Road, Cub Hill, Final Landmarks List #342, MIHP #BA-284; installation of vinyl shutters [County Council District # 6]

Ms. Brown reminded the commissioners that the current owners had previously been before the Commission with renovation plans for this structure. The current owner was requesting permission to install vinyl shutters similar to three wood shutters recently located at the property.

Ms. Brown reported a previous owner had received tax credits for the in-kind replacement of the roof. Because the tax credit stays with the property, the current owners have received a portion of the remaining credit. She stated staff’s recommendation to deny the request to install vinyl shutters.

Mr. Boswell noted there had been no vinyl shutters on the house previously and he felt no shutters would be a better option than vinyl shutters.

Mr. Boswell moved to vote against issuing a Notice to Proceed. Mr. Thaler seconded the motion which passed unanimously on a voice vote.

## Applications for Tax Credit

- \*\*7. Mathews property, 128 Dunkirk Road, contributing structure in the Rodgers Forge National Register Historic District; in-kind repair of slate roof, cooper flashing/snow loops and gutters/downspouts [County Council District #5]

Approved via the consent agenda to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness.

- \*\*8. Crabtree/Shavin property, 404 Dunkirk Road, contributing structure in the Rodgers Forge National Register Historic District; re-point brick mortar, in-kind replacement of the house and garage slate roof and installation of new copper flashings [County Council District #5]

Approved via the consent agenda to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness.

- \*\*9. Moayed property, 402 Murdock Road, contributing structure in the Rodgers Forge National Register Historic District; installation of a central air conditioning system [County Council District #5]

Approved via the consent agenda to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness.

- \*\*10. Patoka/Watkins property, 709 Cliveden Road, MIHP #BA 3097, contributing structure in the Sudbrook Park National Register Historic District and the Sudbrook Park County Historic District; paint/stain/in-kind repairs of all exterior surfaces for both the house and garage, install gutters/downspouts on rear porch and installation of central air-conditioning system(s) [County Council District #2]

Approved via the consent agenda to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness.

11. Skillman property, 905 Adana Road, contributing structure in the Sudbrook Park County Historic District; replacement of an existing slate roof with an asphalt shingle roof, replacement of two wood true divided light windows with aluminum clad wood simulated divided light windows, in-kind replacement of aluminum siding, dormer repairs, interior plaster repairs/replacement, replacement of gutters/downspouts, gas furnace/air conditioning system replacements and re-line chimney [County Council District #2]

Ms. Brown explained that staff had originally approved a tax credit application received on an emergency basis after a tree had fallen on the home causing extensive damage to the roof and dormer. Originally, the property owners intended to replace the slate roof in-kind, repair the dormers in-kind and replace

the windows in-kind. Ms. Brown noted the property owners received approval in 2013 for other tax credit eligible work and that staff recently approved the emergency replacement of the existing furnace.

Ms. Brown explained that because of cost issues the property owners now request approval for replacing the existing slate roof with an asphalt shingle roof and the two wood true divided light windows with aluminum clad wood, simulated divided light windows. Additionally, they request approval for several new tax credit projects. Ms. Brown explained that this section of the Sudbrook Park County Historic District is separate from the original Sudbrook Park community which is typically improved with Victorian type dwellings. The dwellings in this section of Sudbrook Park were constructed during the late 1940s and 1950s based on the Olmsted site plan. Because of this, the area is not included in the Sudbrook Park National Register District and thus not eligible for State tax credits. Ms. Brown noted that two replacements of slate roofs with asphalt shingles had been approved in the district, but in neither case did the applicants receive tax credits for the work or for other proposals.

Ms. Brown stated the issue before the LPC is (a) to consider the request to replace the existing slate roof with an asphalt shingle roof and replacement of two wood true divided light windows with aluminum clad wood simulated divided light windows and (b) to consider whether approval for such replacement would render the property ineligible for of the tax credits granted in the past as well as for all future tax credit applications

Ms. Jessica Skillman, one of the property owners, addressed the LPC explaining the many ways they have tried to address the multiple issues facing them. She explained that replacing a slate roof is cost prohibitive, whether or not they receive a County tax credit.

Mr. Brennan commented the issue to be decided by the LPC is the impact removal of character defining features would have on tax credit eligibility.

Mr. Boswell asked Ms. Skillman whether they had weighed the costs of losing tax credits for past and future projects against the costs of replacing the roof with slate vs. asphalt shingle. Mr. Boswell suggested the possibility of replacing the roof in the front of the home with slate and the roof in the rear with an asphalt shingle material.

Mr. Diggs noted that the letter submitted by the local historic advisory committee supported replacing the slate roof with asphalt shingles, as well as granting past and future tax credits.

Ms. Brown explained that the letter, even though it was written on the Sudbrook Park, Inc. letterhead, came from Dr. Charles Locke, as a property owner. Dr. Locke mentions in the letter that the local advisory committee did not have time

to meet as a group to consider the situation. Ms. Brown reminded the LPC that only the commission has authority to make decisions.

Ms. Brown pointed out that the issue, whether property owners could complete some of the work in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and some contrary to these Standards had been discussed at great length during the recent task force meetings on tax credits. That task force recommended permitting tax credits only for properties where all the work conformed to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Ms. Allen stated the LPC is charged with being the steward of the County's historical communities and, as such, has the responsibility to the taxpayers to protect funds granted as tax credits.

Ms. Skillman questioned the fairness of rescinding both past and future tax credits because of the removal of character defining features. She stated that because of the tax credit program she completed several interior projects in accordance with historic standards and at a higher cost. The roof damage was an act of God that added unexpected expenses and losing both past and future tax credits would punish her. In response to a question of a Commission member whether the Insurance Company would not pay for the slate roof replacement, Ms. Skillman responded that the only type of insurance that she could get was one that reimbursed her for the present value of the slate roof. Because the roof was almost seventy years old, it was at the end of its life expectancy and thus she received only a few thousand dollars for its replacement.

Mr. Thaler stated he felt this particular situation is unique due to the accidental nature of the tree falling on the house. He felt that the tax credits for work already completed should be approved.

Mr. Boswell moved to vote to (a) allow previously approved completed projects to remain tax credit eligible; (b) approve replacing the entire roof with asphalt shingles, replacing the two wood true divided light windows with aluminum clad wood simulated divided light windows - noting that doing so, would cause all present and future tax credit applications to be denied; (c) approve replacing the existing slate roof with slate at the front façade of the dwelling, replacing the existing rear slate roof with asphalt shingles and replacing the two wood true divided light windows in-kind - choosing this scenario would affect that the house remains eligible for present and future tax credit applications. Ms. Allen seconded the motion which passed with Mr. Diggs voting against the motion and Mr. Thaler abstaining.

***Report on County Tax Credit applications approved, or emergency repair approved***

The following historic property tax credit application was approved by staff as an emergency repair or due to the receipt of Part II approval for work reviewed by MHT:

Rees property, 209 Hopkins Road, contributing structure in the Rodgers Forge National Register Historic District; slate roof repairs, water heater replacement, repair and paint windows/screens, clean and paint front and back porch fascia/soffit/header/ceiling, clean and paint garage exterior wood surfaces [County Council District #5]

Wilson property, 369 Old Trail Road, contributing structure in the Rodgers Forge National Register Historic District; replacement of sanitary pipe under basement floor and repairs to resulting damaged floors [County Council District #5]

Coppola property, 910 Adana Road, contributing structure in the Sudbrook Park County Historic District; in-kind replacement of slate roof [County Council District #2]

Patoka/Watkins property, 709 Cliveden Road, MIHP #BA 3097, contributing structure in the Sudbrook Park National Register Historic District and the Sudbrook Park County Historic District; replacement of existing boiler [County Council District #2]

### **Other Business**

#### 11. Pledge of Allegiance

Ms. Brown explained staff had received a request to cease the practice of reciting the Pledge of Allegiance at the beginning of LPC meetings. After a discussion of the subject, Mr. Norman moved to vote to continue reciting the Pledge of Allegiance. The motion passed with a majority of commissioners voting in favor.

Mr. Thaler reported on several upcoming events of historic significance scheduled during 2014 in the Baltimore Region.

A suggestion was made to consider the possibility of creating a program to help homeowners fund historically appropriate work. Mr. Brown noted this could be a topic discussed at a retreat.

Ms. Allen moved to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Horst seconded the motion, which was approved unanimously on a voice vote. The meeting adjourned at 7:35 p.m.

VKN:vkn